



**Facilitator's summary for the three first dialogue meetings
between NSEL and ASOCHIVIDA**

Dialogue Process on Chronic Renal Insufficiency
Facilitator's Summary
April 3, 2009

1. Background

Three dialogue meetings convened by the Office of the Compliance Advisor/Ombudsman (CAO) of the World Bank Group were held in the city of León between February 12 and April 1, 2009. The objective of these meetings in which Nicaragua Sugar Estates Limited (NSEL) and the Chichigalpa Pro-Life Association [*Asociación Chichigalpa por la Vida* ASOCHIVIDA] participated was to identify options to resolve the problem of Chronic Renal Insufficiency (CRI).

This process was conducted in accordance with the guidelines established in the Framework Agreement for Dialogue proposed by the CAO on November 20, 2008, to which the NSEL and ASOCHIVIDA acceded separately. Pursuant to Point No. 6 of this Framework Agreement, the dialogue sessions will focus on and be limited to:

(a) Identifying and addressing the causes of CRI. The parties agree to jointly define the criteria and principles necessary to conduct a study that identifies the causes of CRI, the outcome of which will be transparent and credible to all parties, and provides feasible solutions.

(i) Expected results: An Agreement on the criteria and principles that will guide the study. An Agreement to accept the findings of the study and the options to resolve the problem.

(b) Options for support to local communities where there is a prevalence of CRI. In good faith but with no legal obligation whatsoever, the parties agree to find ways to provide relief to families affected by CRI, involving local resources and State institutions.

(i) Expected result: Relief to families affected by CRI.

2. Developments

Point No. 6.a of the Framework Agreement

In order to conduct a study that identifies the causes of CRI, the outcome of which will be transparent and credible to all parties, and provides feasible solutions, the CAO proposed a four-phase sequence: (1) Dialogue on the Basic Principles and Criteria for the study; (2) Selection of the scientific team; (3) Conduct of the study development process; and (4) Dialogue on the conclusions.

Following the first meeting at which ASOCHIVIDA and the NSEL discussed the criteria and principles for developing the study, the CAO prepared a Terms of Reference document for the selection of the scientific team, which was widely circulated in Spanish



and English. The CAO prepared a timetable for the selection process, which was shared with the NSEL and ASOCHIVIDA, and which establishes Friday, April 3, 2009 as the deadline for the submission of proposals. The CAO also prepared a methodological proposal for rating the proposals received, which was also submitted to the NSEL and ASOCHIVIDA on March 19, 2009 for their consideration. ASOCHIVIDA and the NSEL expressed their appreciation for the World Bank's willingness to provide resources for the preparation of the study. They also indicated that it was acceptable to have additional contributions as long as the necessary mechanisms are in place to ensure that the contributors exert no influence over the outcome.

Point No. 6.b of the Framework Agreement

In good faith but with no legal obligation whatsoever, the NSEL will provide support in the short term in order to provide relief to families affected by CRI, which will entail:

- a) Food support over two years, at an annual cost of US\$300,000 for 1,153 household heads who are members of ASOCHIVIDA, which can be increased to a total of US\$500,000 per year for 1,800 heads of households. Food supplies will be bought at wholesale prices, with the company also having the option of handing over food items of equal value to this amount to an intermediary organization (to be identified by the American Nicaraguan Foundation and CARITAS), and will be delivered in Chichigalpa. The delivery method will be determined jointly with the intermediary organization.
- b) Distribution of school bags to approximately 1,545 children under 18.
- c) Health assistance:
 - i. Acquisition and delivery of an ultrasound machine for the Chichigalpa Health Center.
 - ii. Assistance to the health center with the recruitment of a radiologist to operate the ultrasound machine.
 - iii. Supplementing of the supply of medicines and reagents at the health center.
 - iv. Provision of two hemodialysis machines to the health center.

The requirements for receiving food and education support are as follows:

- Former employee's card number
- Photocopy of the employee's ID
- Photocopy of spouse's or partner's ID (if applicable)
- Photocopy of each child's birth certificate
- Medical certificate issued by Drs. Jarquín, Reyes, or Rugama indicating that the individual is suffering from CRI. Persons who have not obtained a certificate from any of these doctors have three months to do so. In cases where the company has doubts concerning the health status of any individual, it may request, at its own expense, that another diagnostic assessment be carried out at the *Laboratorio Metropolitano de León*. Should anyone have any doubts about his/her results, he/she may undergo another examination at the *Laboratorio Metropolitano de León* at his/her expense.



In order to facilitate the securing of copies of birth certificates, the NSEL and the Board of Directors of ASOCHIVIDA will contact the mayor of Chichigalpa to request his cooperation. The NSEL has expressed its desire to begin providing this assistance in the coming weeks.

As part of its duties, the CAO will monitor the effective delivery of this assistance, in conjunction with the NSEL and ASOCHIVIDA.

In addition to the short-term assistance being offered, the NSEL has indicated its desire to help the families affected by CRI gain access to sources of income and employment that will be sustainable over time and will not involve any debt.

The CAO has committed the services of a technical expert who can collaborate with ASOCHIVIDA members in order to provide them with information on productive projects and alternative sources of employment that could be established in the area.

With respect to health issues, the NSEL and ASOCHIVIDA will work together, with support from the CAO, and will call on other institutions in order to comprehensively improve the health system, taking advantage of the recommendations set forth in the report by Dr. David Silver.

In light of the progress made since the first dialogue meeting, the CAO is of the view that the NSEL and ASOCHIVIDA have demonstrated a genuine commitment to engage in a constructive and collaborative dialogue process that can provide solutions for the CRI problem.

1. Next Steps

The CAO believes that the next steps in this dialogue process should be directed toward:

Point No. 6.a of the Framework Agreement

- Selection of the scientific team that will conduct the study.
- Conduct of the scoping assessment, which should provide an analysis of the range of epidemiological study options, address the likelihood of achieving conclusive answers to the questions posed by the NSEL and ASOCHIVIDA, indicate the effort and time required for each option, and include an objective evaluation of the limitations and uncertainty linked to this type of study.

Point No 6.b of the Framework Agreement

- Ensuring the actual delivery of the short-term food and education support offered by the NSEL.
- Continuing discussions in order to clarify how health assistance will be provided and further develop the analysis of the recommendations presented in the report by Dr. David Silver, with a view to comprehensively improving the health system's response to CRI.
- Initiating discussions on the development of alternative sources of income and employment for former employees and their families, which can be sustained over time.



OFFICE OF THE COMPLIANCE ADVISOR/OMBUDSMAN
2121 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE, NW • WASHINGTON, DC 20433, USA
TELEPHONE (202) 458-1973 • FACSIMILE (202) 522-7400
E-MAIL: CAO-COMPLIANCE@IFC.ORG • INTERNET: WWW.CAO-OMBUDSMAN.ORG

To this end, incorporate the technical expert who can provide support to ASOCHIVIDA for the analysis of the various project options.

- Initiating discussions on when and how to incorporate into the dialogue process other public and private institutions, whose participation can help broaden the scope and increase the sustainability of the solutions being developed to address the problem of CRI.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Juan Dumas', is centered on the page.

Juan Dumas
Discussion Facilitator
Executive Director of *Fundación Futuro Latinoamericano*